

From: [Gage, Laurie J - APHIS](#)
To: [Fashola, Oreoluwa - APHIS](#)
Subject: FW: FW: Amanda Lollar/Animal cruelty at Bat World Sanctuary - status of TX11418 question
Date: Monday, August 10, 2015 5:12:01 PM

FOIA Request 2015-APHIS-04995-F

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM

Big Cat and Marine Mammal Specialist
APHIS Animal Care Center for Animal Welfare

From: Gage, Laurie J - APHIS
Sent: Thursday, August 06, 2015 3:44 PM
To: APHIS-FOIA Officer
Subject: FW: FW: Amanda Lollar/Animal cruelty at Bat World Sanctuary - status of TX11418 question

FOIA Request 2015-APHIS-04995-F

Amanda Lollar request

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM

Big Cat and Marine Mammal Specialist
APHIS Animal Care Center for Animal Welfare

From: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 9:14 AM
To: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Subject: RE: FW: Amanda Lollar/Animal cruelty at Bat World Sanctuary - status of TX11418 question

Connie would be the best place to start.

From: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 11:13 AM
To: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Subject: RE: FW: Amanda Lollar/Animal cruelty at Bat World Sanctuary - status of TX11418 question

Should I contact Connie? I hate to ding someone based on a bogus utube video.

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM

Field Specialist for Big Cats and Marine Mammals

From: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 9:06 AM
To: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Subject: FW: FW: Amanda Lollar/Animal cruelty at Bat World Sanctuary - status of TX11418 question

From: [Digesualdo, Cynthia L \(APHIS\)](#)
To: [Gage, Laurie J \(APHIS\)](#)
Subject: RE: bat video
Date: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 10:38:32 AM
Attachments: [Response to complaint.docx](#)
[Letters from veterinarians, PVC.pdf](#)

The video was altered. Momma bat did fine and was released. Her vet trained her on this procedure and is perfectly comfortable with her performing it without him present. This lady does a great job with these bats. I've attached all the info I provided to the office in response to these complaints from (b) (6), (b) (7)(C), (b) (7)(D). The letters from veterinarians attachment has some pages from the book she has published.

From: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 9:17 AM
To: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Subject: RE: bat video

Can you tell me what your question is? I thought it was a clear violation of the AWA as the lady was doing a veterinary procedure on a bat with no anesthesia and without the apparent skills necessary to do the job. The bat suffered severe pain and then later it died.

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM
Field Specialist for Big Cats and Marine Mammals

From: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 7:07 AM
To: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Subject: RE: bat video

(b) (6), (b) (7)(C), (b) (7)(D)

Thanks

From: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 9:06 AM
To: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Subject: RE: bat video

Am in the PRT meeting. Left cell phone in hotel room (oops)

Can't call you until we have a break. What number should I call? I am in the ER.

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM
Field Specialist for Big Cats and Marine Mammals

From: Digesualdo, Cynthia L (APHIS)
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2011 7:03 AM

From: [Gage, Laurie J - APHIS](#)
To: [Fashola, Oreoluwa - APHIS](#)
Subject: FW: Affidavit of Amanda Lollar, AW Complaint No. W11-108
Date: Monday, August 10, 2015 5:11:29 PM

FOIA Request 2015-APHIS-04995-F

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM

Big Cat and Marine Mammal Specialist
APHIS Animal Care Center for Animal Welfare

From: Gage, Laurie J - APHIS
Sent: Thursday, August 06, 2015 3:38 PM
To: APHIS-FOIA Officer
Subject: FW: Affidavit of Amanda Lollar, AW Complaint No. W11-108

Original email to Dr. Gibbens re: Amanda Lollar FOIA Request 2015-APHIS-04995-F

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM

Big Cat and Marine Mammal Specialist
APHIS Animal Care Center for Animal Welfare

From: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)
Sent: Thursday, September 08, 2011 7:44 AM
To: Gibbens, Robert (APHIS)
Subject: RE: Affidavit of Amanda Lollar, AW Complaint No. W11-108

Hi Bob

I agree. Ms Lollar does sound knowledgeable and answered a few questions I had about this procedure. In the video I could see that she had applied a cotton tipped swab to the area and I wondered if there were a topical anesthetic on that swab. She stated in her affidavit that there was. I also surmised that she did not use iso to anesthetize the mother bat even though somewhere it was stated that iso was available, because she was afraid it would also anesthetize the pup. I think I would have done the same thing for this procedure and not use iso for fear it might kill the pup.

Also I wondered when I spoke with Cindy D. if this were a rehab bat or a resident bat. She did not know. If the rehab bats are not on public display then I do not believe we regulate rehab animals. In this affidavit Lollar states the animal was indeed a rehab animal.

I never saw a photograph of the vagina glued shut, so can only go with the word of the complainant. If there is no clear evidence of that then I tend not to want to judge someone's ability on hearsay. I believe the video did look "bad" because the bat struggled a little bit, but my previous judgment was based in part on what the complainant stated: that the bat's vaginal opening was glued shut and that the bat died. If neither of these are true then I do not have

any serious concerns about that procedure.

I did speak with Kevin McLaughlin yesterday and told him pretty much what I told you in this email.

I hope this helps.

Laurie J. Gage, DVM, Dipl ACZM

Field Specialist for Big Cats and Marine Mammals

From: Gibbens, Robert (APHIS)

Sent: Thursday, September 08, 2011 6:23 AM

To: Gage, Laurie J (APHIS)

Subject: FW: Affidavit of Amanda Lollar, AW Complaint No. W11-108

It appears topical anesthesia was used. It appears that the mother bat survived and was later released. (b) (6), (b) (7)(C), (b) (7)(D)

Lollar sounds knowledgeable, although I don't know if some of her claims about bat procedures, physiology, and behavior are in accordance with the current professional knowledge of bats. Your thoughts?

From: McLaughlin, Kevin L (APHIS)

Sent: Thursday, September 08, 2011 7:14 AM

To: Gibbens, Robert (APHIS)

Cc: (b) (6), (b) (7)(C) (APHIS)

Subject: Affidavit of Amanda Lollar, AW Complaint No. W11-108

Dr. Gibbens,

I was able to interview Bat World Sanctuary President Amanda Lollar yesterday regarding the complaint no. W11-108, filed by (b) (6), (b) (7)(C), (b) (7)(D). Attached is the electronic copy of the affidavit I received from her; I wanted to give you an opportunity to look over it and then I was planning to give you a call to discuss the matter.

I was unable to obtain a copy of the video (b) (6), (b) (7)(C), (b) (7)(D) which alleged that Lollar was in violation of the AWA. Ms. Lollar is still trying to get the video to me, either by e-mail, or whatever means necessary.

I did take several pictures of the facility, I will e-mail them separately.

Thanks,
Kevin McLaughlin
(817) 807-3608

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement:

I make the following voluntary statement to Kevin McLaughlin, who has identified himself as an Investigator for the U.S. Department of Agriculture, Animal & Plant Health Inspection Service, Investigative & Enforcement Services.

My name is Amanda Lollar, I am the President of Bat World Sanctuary which I founded in 1994. My business address is 217 N. Oak Ave., Mineral Wells, TX, 76067, and my phone number is (940) 325-3404. As the President of Bat World Sanctuary I do the actual animal care, and the animal care oversight, grant writer, web developer, and membership coordinator, among many other duties. This is an all volunteer organization, no one receives pay. Bat World Sanctuary is a sanctuary for non-releasable bats, and a rescue and rehabilitation center designed to promote conservation and understanding of bats. Besides being licensed with the Texas Parks & Wildlife Department, we are also licensed with the U.S Department of Agriculture, license no. 74-C-0287; we have held this license since at least 1995.

Bat World Sanctuary does not intentionally breed bats, nor do we sell bats. All the male fruit bats are neutered, however, on occasion there are some pregnancies. The main reason being is that we obtain some bats from zoo rescues that are already bred, and others for rehabilitation that are bred. Having said that, we did conduct a reproductive study with the bats in 1998.

In the past, Bat World Sanctuary conducted outreach programs; this was the purpose of our obtaining a USDA license. We are no longer doing the outreach programs, and therefore will probably not renew our USDA license. All training and educational programs will be conducted on-line. Our online training has already started with the introduction of my subscription book, Standards and Medical Management for Captive Insectivorous Bats.

Bat World Sanctuary has provided internships for individuals interested in studying bats for over a decade. Through these internships we have trained over 400 veterinarians, rehabilitation experts, scientists, and wildlife officials from all over the world.

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas on this 7th day of September, 2011.

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement:

One of the interns that studied here was Mary Cummings, her internship lasted from 06/20/10 to 06/28/10. Cummings was not accepted as a funded internship, we provided her training for free. As an intern, Cummings was supposed to learn how to care for captive assurance colonies and injured bats, maintain cages, nutritional requirements, repair wing fractures, proper injection techniques, parasite control, symptoms of rabies, learn about pregnancy problems, common problems with bats in captivity. What she did instead was go to out to eat every meal, left cage doors open daily, 4 babies died under her care, she failed to follow directions, she neglected to clean cages, and she took photos and videos of bats without permission. She disturbed the animals in the process of getting the photos and videos. One of the bats she videoed was severely debilitated with cancer and she drug the animal out of the cage to get the video. This was an ex-research animal that developed the cancer from the drug testing. Later on Cummings posted the video on the internet, alluding that all the animals were in this debilitated state.

Cummings also posted on the internet that she found a dead bat under the desk. This is untrue. She also said that I take ill and orphaned bats from our wild sanctuary and put them in our indoor colony without quarantine; that is untrue. She also claimed the indoor colony had mites, that is also untrue. She also said the internship rooms were infested with bugs, that is untrue. She also said a bat fell in the trash can while she was her, that was untrue. She said that I was breeding bats, that is untrue. She also claimed that I do not have a U.S. Fish and Wildlife permit, that is because I am not required to have one. She also claimed that she picked up two rabid bats per day and that I threw them into the regular trash, this is untrue.

After leaving the internship, Cummings contacted the Texas Department of Health and told them there were numerous unvaccinated people working here that were being bitten by rabid bats. The Center for Disease Control got involved and contacted every intern and photographer

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas on this 7th day of September, 2011.

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement: that had been here for the past year. The end result was that there were no violations, but they did ask that we change a couple words in our informational flyer.

Cummings also made accusations that I administered rabies vaccinations to bats, that I obtained prescription veterinary drugs under false pretenses and that I sell these drugs to other rehabilitators, and that I performed surgeries and administered anesthesia without a veterinary license. These allegations led to the complaint being filed with the USDA and this is the reason for Kevin McLaughlin’s visit.

As to the controlled substances that Cummings said I was using, I do use Isoflurane under the direction of my veterinarian. I use the Isoflurane for euthanasia and anesthesia purposes. Isoflurane is not a controlled substance, I purchase it directly from Dr. Tad Jarrett, who is our current attending veterinarian. Dr. Jarrett neuters the male bats and when my knowledge base is limited I contact him, and for any type of procedure that is beyond my scope of knowledge I contact him. At no time do I administer rabies vaccines to the bats, the bats are simply not rabies vaccinated. In 2006, Bat World Sanctuary collaborated in a research study with Boston University and the Center for Disease Control – during that time all the bats were vaccinated. They did leave approximately 25-50 doses of rabies vaccine here afterwards and I did administer it, I did not want to see it go to waste. I was well aware of how to administer the vaccine, and we recommend vaccinating all insectivorous bats because it has been shown to be effective. To the best of my knowledge the fruit bats we have are already vaccinated prior to arrival.

I do not perform surgeries as suggested by Mary Cummings; on occasion I will perform wing procedures and episiotomies, both under veterinary guidance. Although I am not a licensed veterinarian, I would consider myself an expert on bats and their behavior, I have written four books over the past two decades on the rehabilitation and captive care of insectivorous bats. In addition, I have provided numerous training to veterinarians regarding the rehabilitation of bats.

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas on this 7th day of September, 2011.

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement:

Kevin McLaughlin has a copy of my Curriculum Vitae, which is an accurate representation of my abilities and achievements.

While under the internship, Mary Cummings recorded a video of me performing an episiotomy on a bat. The bat in question survived the procedure, and was later released back into the wild. The pup was stillborn. The mother bat was never intended for exhibit, it was being rehabilitated under a permit from the Texas Parks and Wildlife Department. I have provided Kevin McLaughlin with a copy of the permit. Mary Cummings released the video on the internet alluding that I was in violation of the Animal Welfare Act and that I was being inhumane.

First off, I want to point out that with insectivorous bat pups, the pup is typically 1/3 the size of the mother; this is the equivalent of a 120 lb. woman giving birth to a 40 lb. baby. When these pups get stuck in the birth canal, the mother and the pup are going to die if intervention is not achieved. It usually takes a couple of days for this to happen. *The reason I know this is because back in 1994, or 1995, one the bats I was caring for had a pup lodged in her birth canal, Dr. Jarrett was away and I waited 2 days for him to return. On the second day the mother bat died soon after I arrived at Dr. Jarrett's office-she died because her uterus ruptured. It was soon afterwards that Dr. Jarrett instructed me on how to perform an episiotomy. This was a rehab bat, not an exhibit bat.*

The bat shown in the video was rescued from the wild sanctuary, which is a free ranging colony that we protect. During baby season we check for bats in trouble and orphans, that it when we discovered the bat in question.

I am providing Kevin McLaughlin with a copy of the video that Mary Cummings placed on the internet, this is the video she shot as an intern at Bat World Sanctuary and contains her notations of what is occurring. The video and photo of the episiotomy was being done for my

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas on this 7th day of September, 2011.

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement:
upcoming subscription book. Kevin and I reviewed the video and the following is my interpretation of what was actually occurring:

Before the video even begins, I had instructed all the interns that when I said “clear” that one of them needs to stop taking pictures or video and clear the pups face of afterbirth. The video shows me applying Cetacaine (a topical anesthetic requiring a veterinary prescription, I obtained it legally) to the bats vaginal area. While it is taking effect I give instructions to interns on how to take photos in order that they can be used for the book I was preparing. The video does not show us waiting, but it does show the Cetacaine being applied with a cotton swab. Cummings notation on her video states that I cut the vagina with scissors three times, that is not what occurred. To explain, this was a twin episiotomy, what happened was that I made two incisions with surgical scissors, each incision less than 1 mm. One incision was too small, so I cut further in the same spot. In addition, I was wearing triple magnification lenses while performing this episiotomy. Cummings next notation states that the bat was convulsing, the bat does not convulse. To explain, micro bat behavior makes them jerk when they are distressed, such as being held; when they are in physical pain they clearly cry out and make lots of noise—this bat never cried out. At one point in the video, I asked “Where’s Kay?” Kay was one of the interns that had disappeared during the episiotomy; I wanted her to be present to learn about the procedure. Cummings states in her next notation that I stabbed the pup, when in fact you plainly hear me say in the video that I did not stab the baby. In the next notation Cummings says that I can’t tell the difference between a foot and a head. What had happened was that the pup was still in the birth sac and I certainly couldn’t tell at that particular point, as heard in the video, I soon realize that it is the head and not the foot as I had first thought. At one point in the video I said that I wished I could knock her out, the reason I cannot anesthetize the mother is that it anesthetizes the baby as well. If the baby is anesthetized you run the risk of losing the baby. (I

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas
on this 7th day of September, 2011.

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement:
always anesthetize the mother after the baby is out in order to close the incisions) Cummings next notation states that I pull too much and the bats vagina/uterus prolapses. As shown in the video, I pull the pup from the mother and I state that she is going to prolapse because I was afraid she was going to – but she did not prolapse. Cummings believed the afterbirth to be the vagina and uterus that was pulled out, the video clearly shows the afterbirth. Next in the video I said “clear”, Cummings (who was shooting the video) cuts her video off and shows the bat anesthetized with the narration that the bat passes out from shock and later dies. In this view the Isoflurane cone should have been in view, she either cut it out of the video or somehow moved it from view. The next view shows the newborn pup, which was stillborn, Cummings asked to look at the newborn pup, (I obliged since I want everybody to learn) and as shown in the video, Cummings is holding it in her hand with the notation that “The baby is pink yet dead. It had just died”. In reality, there was no way of knowing how long this baby had been dead.

The mother in this video lived, the pictures of this bats vagina are in the paperwork that I have provided to Kevin McLaughlin. The video says that I glued the vagina shut and she died. In the photos you can clearly see that the vagina is not surgically glued shut. Cummings has reported three different ways that this bat died, she stated in court that the bat recuperated and was placed in a cage and then disappeared, Cummings assumed she died. In another report, Cummings stated that the bat when into convulsions and shock and died during the procedure.

I am comfortable performing the episiotomies; I have saved hundreds of babies and mothers using this emergency procedure. This procedure often has to be performed at night, and a veterinarian cannot arrive quickly enough to save the animals.

We did another episiotomy this year, the procedure was overseen by Dr. Janet Messner, DVM. The procedure was almost identical to what happened in Cummings video. All went well, the baby was stillborn which could not be helped, but the mother was fine and released.

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas
on this 7th day of September, 2011.

AFFIDAVIT

I, Amanda Lollar, being duly sworn on oath make the following voluntary statement:

I want to provide the following names and phone numbers of people who witnessed the episiotomy and/or the recovery and/or the release of the bat that is shown in the video:

- Dottie Hyatt (817) 431-4866
- Kate Rugroden (817) 303-7597
- Julie Landreth (434) 592-1340
- Jeanette Villareal (940) 327-7326

I would like to add that Kay Singleton was another intern who became good friends with Mary Cummings during their time as interns at Bat World Sanctuary. Ms. Singleton was not honest about her health issues before arriving for the internship, and when it was discovered that she had asthma, emphysema, COPD, and had had two heat strokes she was sent home early. We have since learned that Kay Singleton has written an affidavit for Mary Cummings and intends to testify on her behalf in court.

I have read this affidavit and had an opportunity to make necessary corrections and/or additions, and swear that all information contained therein is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and I so swear.

-----END OF AFFIDAVIT-----

SIGNATURE OF AFFIANT

Subscribed and sworn to before me at Bat World Sanctuary in Mineral Wells, Texas
on this 7th day of September, 2011.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE
ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH INSPECTION SERVICE
INVESTIGATIVE AND ENFORCEMENT SERVICES

REPORT OF INVESTIGATION

Case Number: TX11418-AC

Subject(s): Bat World Sanctuary
(Contact Information) 217 N. Oak Avenue
Mineral Wells, TX 76067
(940) 325-3404

Investigator: (b)(6), (b)(7)(C)
(Contact Information) IES Sr. Investigator
2150 Centre Ave., Bldg. B (b)(6), (b)(7)(C)
Ft. Collins, CO 80526
Cell: (b)(6), (b)(7)(C)

Date of Report: September 16, 2011

- Substantiated allegation(s)**
- No violation(s)**
- Insufficient evidence**
- Fact finding**
- Contains Confidential Business Information**

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

This document and its contents are not to be distributed outside your agency, or duplicated, without prior consent from USDA APHIS Investigative and Enforcement Services.

Reviewer(s) _____

(b)(6), (b)(7)(C)

From: Gibbens, Robert - APHIS
Sent: Friday, September 30, 2011 9:25 AM
To: (b)(6), (b)(7)(C) - APHIS
Cc: Nickerson, Eric S - APHIS; Fordahl, Timothy R - APHIS (b)(6)(b)(7)(C)
Subject: (b)(6), (b)(7)(C)
Re: TX11418-AC; Bat World Sanctuary

Yes - no violation. Thanks.

From: (b)(6), (b)(7)(C)
Sent: Friday, September 30, 2011 07:02 AM
To: Gibbens, Robert - APHIS
Cc: Nickerson, Eric S - APHIS; Fordahl, Timothy R - APHIS
Subject: TX11418-AC; Bat World Sanctuary

Hi Dr. Gibbens,

By now you should have received the program copy of subject case prepared as a No Violation report by (b)(6), (b)(7)(C) documented the matter as 'no violation' based on the evidence compiled regarding this matter and his earlier discussion with you re same.

Please advise if you are still in agreement with closing this matter as no violation, and if so, I'll see about doing so and getting the original submitted to IES HQ.

Thanks,

(b)(6), (b)(7)(C)

From: "Juarez, Bernadette R - APHIS" <Bernadette.R.Juarez@aphis.usda.gov>
To: "sanctuary@batworld.org" <sanctuary@batworld.org>
Cc: "Gibbens, Robert - APHIS" <Robert.M.Gibbens@aphis.usda.gov>; "Shea, Kevin A - APHIS" <Kevin.A.Shea@aphis.usda.gov>; "Huttenlocker, Robert J - APHIS" <Robert.J.Huttenlocker@aphis.usda.gov>
Sent: Monday, October 3, 2011 6:00 PM
Subject: Pending FOIA Request for Bat World Investigation

Ms. Lollar:

I write on behalf of the Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS), and in response to your inquiry about the status of our investigation involving your facility known as Bat World.

Please know that we have just concluded our fact finding investigation involving Bat World and, based on the evidence in our possession, did not identify any violations under the Animal Welfare Act in connection with the issues that we examined. We plan to provide APHIS' Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) Office with a copy of our final fact finding investigative report on October 4. I understand that you have a pending FOIA request in which you seek a copy of this report, and I am committed to ensuring that you receive a copy of the report as soon as possible. I will confer with APHIS' FOIA Office tomorrow and send you a second email message to let you know when and how you should expect to receive your copy of the report.

Please let me know if you have any further questions.

Bernadette Juarez
Deputy Director, APHIS, Investigative and Enforcement Services